

INDIA CIVIL Society response

to 12th Open Working Group (OWG) Document



We are at the end of a long, open and consultative process anchored by the UN Open Working Group. After fiftytwo days of formal discussions and six days of informal conversations spread over a year and four months to formulate a new set of goals that will succeed the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) in 2015, it is time to congratulate and thank the Co-Chairs, Ambassador Macharia Kamau (Permanent Representative of Kenya) and Ambassador Csaba Korosi (Permanent Representative of Hungary) for their able guidance and perseverance to see through the process to its logical conclusion. As civil society actors representing the global South,* we put together our response to the latest Open Working Group Document (dated June 30, 2014**) and the 17 proposed goals and attendant targets. We also articulate key principles that we feel must guide the new global development agenda and 'must-haves' in the new framework.

^{*} Names of organisations / networks are at the end of the document

^{**} Link to OWG Working Document - http://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/4044zerodraft.pdf

1. Our Overall Assessment

We welcome the goal focusing on **reducing inequality within and between countries** but are concerned with some of the targets that are significantly watered-down. To address inequality more comprehensively, reducing wealth inequality (e.g. the relation of the richest 10% to the poorest 40%) would be critical.

We welcome the chapeau text that frames the 17 proposed goals and reiterate our call for a greater emphasis on foregrounding it in a "human rights approach" to ensure 'no one is left behind' this time round. Furthermore, as activists promoting right to development and human rights for all, it is with concern that we note the inclusion in the chapeau, reference to the 'active engagement of private sector' in implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

We welcome the goal on '**Peaceful and inclusive societies, access to justice, effective and capable institutions**', and call on member states to retain it as this will prove to be one of the transformative blocks for the post-2015 agenda. Specifically, we are happy to note the centrality to access to justice but call for re-introduction of 'rule of law' along with other modifications in the goal.

While we welcome that **climate change** is now also mentioned in the chapeau, the goal appears weakened in terms of its language and has been substantially trimmed down. While most other goals have 6-7 targets, SDG 13 has only 3 with one target on MOI. We call for more concrete targets pertaining to emissions reduction.

We welcome the **sustainable consumption and production** goal and call for strengthening role of developed and emerging economies.

While we thank the Co-Chairs for taking note of our suggestion to re-articulate the emphasis around **eco-nomic growth** by also addressing concerns of "inclusive and sustainable development", we reiterate our concern that the economic pillar has been over-emphasised with another goal on industrialisation and infrastructure. On the other hand, the necessary foregrounding of all goals in a human rights perspective remains absent.

While the timelines for the **gender equality** goal are back, the ambition is inadequate as critical aspects related to framing gender-responsive policies, i.e. promoting gender-responsive budgeting, have been removed. We are also concerned that gender concerns are not mainstreamed in proposed SDGs 12, 13, 14 and 15.

We again thank the Co-Chairs for factoring in our suggestion to incorporate both a standalone component for overarching instruments as well as individual **Means of implementation** (MOI) for each goal. However, both the revised goal as well as MOI within all goals seem significantly watered down.

The UN Millennium Declaration sought collective responsibility to ensure human dignity, equality and equity and to ensure that globalization becomes a positive force for all the world's people to ensure its benefits and costs are evenly shared. From a global south perspective, we are concerned that the post-2015 SDG agenda will not succeed if these are not adhered to now. More specifically, we refer to the development cooperation that must ideally be between governments of developed and developing countries, with the developed countries leading in providing resources and the means of implementation. We also reiterate the concern over the declining role of the state and its implications for the partnerships with non-state actors that are being explored to operationalise many of the goals that are in most cases, fundamental rights.

Finally, while agreeing with the Co-Chairs on the need to ensure that the SDGs be action-oriented and concise (Co-Chair's Letter), we would like to emphasise that these goals will be applicable globally and must be as comprehensive and broad-based as possible. For the majority that has been left at the margins globally and for so long now, it would be the quality, and not the number of goals that would matter most. Hence, we call upon you to see that the post-2015 SDGs are truly transformative and forward-looking.

2. Critical 'Misses' / Over-prioritised Focus Areas

Particularly from a developing South perspective, we would like to focus on following 'misses' and overprioritised focus areas:

- Overall, clearly-defined, specifically-earmarked responsibilities for the developed countries seems to be missing from the proposed goals and targets. In most goals, actions are centred more for the developing countries. Cases in point include proposed SDGs 7,¹ 10,² 13,³ 14,⁴ 15,⁵ 16⁶ and 17.⁷
- The articulation of the proposed SDGs do not adequately address challenges of social exclusion and absence of basic human rights of the most disadvantaged, such as women, children, the older people, migrants, religious minorities, indigenous people, persons with disabilities and young persons.
- Goal 1 (*End poverty everywhere*) does not make any mention of inequality in its present articulation. By also removing reference to '*in all its forms*', it runs the risk of neglecting the multi-dimensional nature of poverty and the attendant manifestations, akin to the MDGs.
- Goal 2 (*End hunger, improve nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture*) needs to bring back reference to securing food sovereignty to make any impact and the watered-down language '*improve nutrition*' needs to be changed to '*ensure adequate nutrition*'. It also fails to make note of land rights in the context of access to global commons.
- In Goal 3 (*Attain healthy lives for all*), it is critical to recognise that universal health care is tax-financed, either as part of Goal 3 or within the proposed Means of Implementation, as without this clarity, we might be looking at an insurance-based model.
- Goal 4 (*Provide quality education and life-long learning opportunities for all*) does not clarify the mode of financing this goal. Further, scholarships for higher education delivered within developed countries and subsidizing seats in the north are over-emphasised and would have negligible or no effect at improving the educational status worldwide.
- We are concerned with some of the changes in Goal 5 (*Attain gender equality, empower women and girls everywhere*) even as the timelines have been restored. Two instances: a target on evaluating gender-responsiveness of policy commitments through gender responsive budgeting has been removed. Additionally, specific reference needs to be made to the most-marginalised among women, e.g. women and girls with disabilities.
- For Goal 6 (*Secure water and sanitation for all for a sustainable world*), the means of implementation is sketchy and appears to be entirely technology and business-driven in terms of international cooperation. There is no mention of the people or the community.
- Goal 8 (*Promote strong, inclusive and sustainable economic growth and decent work for all*) unduly emphasizes economic growth which would anyway be a priority focus area for all countries rather than addressing gaps in sustainable development. Further, most of the proposed targets read like broad policy recommendations.

7 Strengthen the means of implementation and the global partnership for sustainable development

¹ Ensure sustainable energy for all

² Reduce inequality within and between countries

³ Tackle climate change and its impacts

⁴ Conserve and promote sustainable use of oceans, seas and marine resources

⁵ Protect and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, halt desertification, land degradation and biodiversity loss

⁶ Achieve peaceful and inclusive societies, access to justice for all, and effective and capable institutions

- Goal 9 (*Promote sustainable industrialization*) fails to clearly outlines accountability and monitoring mechanisms that would be applicable for the industry. It does not feature even as part of Goal 9's Means of Implementation.
- Goals 12⁸, 13⁹, 14¹⁰ and 15¹¹ do not mainstream gender concerns and this would negatively impact the overall gains that might be made as without addressing women's rights to sustainable development.
- Goal 17 (*Strengthen and enhance the means of implementation and global partnership for sustainable development*) in its present articulation is akin to the MDG 8 (Develop a global partnership for development) that did not outline specific, measurable and time-bound commitments for developed countries.

3. Our Non-Negotiables

The post-2015 development discourse must be defined by the following Five Principles:

- 1. The existing MDGs have largely ignored the universality, indivisibility, inter-dependence and inter-relatedness of **human rights**. If the post-2015 development agenda is to remain relevant, it must emphasize on the fundamental inalienability of human rights as the macro frame to locate within it specific goals and targets.
- 2. Inequalities, discrimination and social exclusion, particularly caste, ethnic and gender inequalities, have always been inadequately addressed. The evolving development agenda in the post-2015 frame needs to focus on diagnostic, i.e. structural reforms, rather than prescriptive measures. In this context, it becomes necessary to ensure that all prevalent macroeconomic policy directions that fosters and perpetuate inequalities and social exclusion be reviewed through the lens of intersectionalities including discrimination based on caste, religious, sexual and gender identities. Widely-accessible, non-discriminatory, participatory and quality basic public services including in health, water and sanitation, education and housing, comprehensive services for survivors of violence, among others must be ensured. Excluded communities, especially women, must be involved in planning and setting their agendas, engaged in budget formulations and also of development schemes that are of benefit to the community and focus on the most vulnerable such as single women, survivors of violence and children.
- 3. A gender-transformative, gender-inclusive and gender-responsive policy frame guided by principles of gender equality and equity is essential to advance and achieve full potential of all women in all spheres of life, namely, economic, social and political. For this, generation of across-the-board gender-disag-gregated data, fair representation of women on all decision-making platforms, equitable ownership and control over productive resources and a world free of violence and harassment against girls and women, where justice can be accessed and women claim their dignity, autonomy and bodily integrity, and where prevailing masculinity norms are challenged is sought.
- 4. The principle of a **sustainable development pathway**, when seen from the lens of the majority of the population of the globe, and the dangers of climate change, would mean in real terms year round access to basic necessities of food, shelter and livelihood for all men and women to survive with dignity and to secure these basic necessities even in the wake of climate variability. The goal must not be merely to alleviate poverty but to ensure 'well-being', where economic and environmental sustainability are simultaneously ensured and the world acts together to reverse global warming and deal adequately with its impacts. To achieve this would imply a bottom-up perspective to the development trajectory. The vision

⁸ Promote sustainable consumption and production patterns

⁹ Tackle climate change and its impacts

¹⁰ Conserve and promote sustainable use of oceans, seas and marine resources

¹¹ Protect and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, halt desertification, land degradation and biodiversity loss

of a low carbon society is an opportunity for us to make development choices, especially since we have large populations in developing countries which have yet to have access to basic energy.

5. The principle of **'just' governance** must translate into the government being responsive to the needs of the people. There is a need for greater transparency, accountability and participation in terms of economic policymaking. 'Just governance should be the cornerstone of governance reform and adequate institutions, capacities and resources need to be allocated to ensure implementation. This principle needs to apply not only to public institutions but to the private sector, to global governance institutions and to the developed world to ensure a level playing field.

Foregrounded by these principles, we have identified <u>15 Key Concerns</u> that would need to be addressed by the post-2015 development agenda:

- 1. Equitable access to basic quality public *healthcare* linking it with access to safe and sustainable water supply and sanitation. Benchmarks for financing for health through domestic resources and through ensuring compliance with existing donor targets for aid must be laid down.
- 2. Universal inclusive basic *education* with focus on quality and equity that also addresses concerns of retention, completion and the learning environment. Delivery on this would entail adequate financing through a global benchmark for public spending and aid commitments.
- 3. Ensuring universal *food and nutrition security* focusing on children (including children with disabilities) and other marginalized groups such as migrants, aged, single women and persons with disabilities. To elaborate this a bit more: Food security and nutrition security are different but interlinked concepts. Nutrition security is multidimensional. Solutions to improve nutrition in a given country context will require integration among the sectors most relevant to individuals' nutritional status, such as trade and infrastructure, agriculture, and labour market, as well as social sectors such as health, education, and social protection.
- **4.** *Employment and livelihood* needs to be attended to. Autonomy and sustainability of livelihood in the new economy wherein every person is enabled to avail their full capacity and a consensus on a social protection 'floor of dignity' below which no one should be allowed to fall must be arrived at.

In all these, it is important to note that ensuring a rights-based approach, improved governance and accountability along with political commitment are critical to achieving results

Peace and conflict have become very critical in today's times and measurable targets for creation of gainful employment along with reduction in arms and armed militia in conflict-affected areas with special attention to women and the minorities is needed.

Moving on to some of the broader narratives, special focus on *human rights* is called for with monitorable targets to assess progress in human 'well-being' and dignity as opposed to mere human survival. The Constitutional tenets are the most fundamental and need to be referred to. Other references include UN Conventions on rights of child, persons with disabilities, and women.

A key aspect that has not been adequately stressed is *social inclusion* which needs to be articulated through non-discriminatory, participatory and monitorable targets focusing on advancing the rights of the most-excluded and the disadvantaged such as the Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes, Denotified Nomadic Tribes, religious minorities, children, aged, and persons with disabilities.

Another cross-cutting vital concern is that of *gender justice* and there is a need to establish gender equality through policy instruments designed to shift away from patriarchal social order, institutions and mindsets.

Addressing poverty and inequality is fundamental and for this, greater investments in irrigation, power, agricultural research and development, and roads in the poorer regions, where the concentration of poverty is increasing is called for. Further, progressive and redistributive taxation, public spending, especially for foundational investment in human capital, along with reforms in land and forest policies are vital to reducing inequalities. Transparency in public spending and greater participation in determining spending priorities is called for.

Environmental justice is another cross-cutting concern and a multi-pronged approach is needed. To cite one of these, more investments to renewable technologies, and innovative measures to help poor people adapt to climate change impacts in agriculture-related sectors and disaster management, and building sustainable cities focusing on public transport policies is necessary.

'Just' governance provides a vital plank to base all of the aforementioned. Strong accountability mechanisms for better implementation and monitoring of basic services to all are sought. Public provisioning for basic services, decentralising decision making, people-centred planning and citizen-led monitoring are critical. For this, greater budget transparency, accountability in government spending, citizen involvement in determining budget priorities, participation in budget monitoring are also extremely vital.

Another aspect that is being focused but needs greater emphasis is *financing for development*. Developing countries need to step up domestic resource mobilisation through increased tax-GDP ratios. Further, both developed and developing countries need to plug tax loopholes to check illicit financial flows that lead to significant loss of tax revenue and tax evasion. Innovative financial mechanisms also need to be explored as alternative funding options.

Specifically, the *role of developed countries* in shaping the post-2015 development agenda must not be limited to making mere prescriptive policy changes but bringing about substantive course correction in the prevalent economic policy paradigm. In this regard, the most critical *partnership* should be between the developed and the developing countries, with the developed countries leading on financing and technology transfer.

On the need for *partnerships for development*, we would expect clearly monitorable targets for the corporate sector in ensuring accountable, transparent and socially-just practices and processes.

Finally, to ensure that these processes are seamless and not stand-alone country specific efforts, there is a need for increased policy spaces to foster *South-South cooperation* in participating and influencing the post-2015 development agenda.

4. Our Observations on Goals and Targets

In Blue: Recommendations for re-insertion from previous version(s) of OWG Document

In Red: Additional recommendations

Comments on the Chapeau Text:

- We welcome the Chapeau and its upholding principles of "...freedom, peace and security, respect for all human rights, including the right to development and the right to an adequate standard of living, including the right to food, the rule of law, good governance, gender equality, women's empowerment and the overall commitment to just and democratic societies for development".
- We welcome the addition of text around climate change in the Chapeau.
- It is with concern that we note couple of references in the Chapeau to the 'active engagement of private sector' in implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). However, the entire document

fails to make note of social exclusion of a vast majority globally owing to multiple forms of discrimination due to age, sex, disability, religion, caste, race, ethnicity, work and descent.

• While welcoming the Chapeau's emphasis on the developing countries' need for additional resources for sustainable development, we are concerned that adequate attention has not been given to the role of developed countries in financing the post-2015 agenda.

Introduction and Proposed Goals and Targets on Sustainable Development for the Post-2015 Development Agenda

Poverty eradication is the greatest global challenge facing the world today and an indispensable requirement for sustainable development. We are therefore committed to freeing humanity from poverty and hunger as a matter of urgency.

We recognize that poverty eradication, changing unsustainable and promoting sustainable patterns of consumption and production [ADD: growing impacts of climate change] and protecting and managing the natural resource base of economic and social development are the overarching objectives of and essential requirements for sustainable development. [ADD: We recognise the link between ensuring access to justice to promoting 'just' and peaceful societies that would further developing a respect for human rights culture.]

We reaffirm that climate change is one of the greatest challenges of our time, and we express profound alarm that emissions of greenhouse gases continue to rise globally. We underscore that the global nature of climate change calls for the widest possible cooperation by all countries [ADD: especially the developed countries] and their participation in an effective and appropriate international response, [ADD: in keeping with the principle of Common But Differentiated Responsibilities] with a view to accelerating the reduction of global greenhouse gas emissions.

We reaffirm our commitment to fully implement the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development, Agenda 21, the Programme for the Further Implementation of Agenda 21, the Plan of Implementation of the World Summit on Sustainable Development (Johannesburg Plan of Implementation) and the Johannesburg Declaration on Sustainable Development of the World Summit on Sustainable Development, the Programme of Action for the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States (Barbados Programme of Action) and the Mauritius Strategy for the Further Implementation of the Programme of Action for the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States. We also reaffirm our commitment to the full implementation of the Programme of Action for the Least Developed Countries for the Decade 2011-2020 (Istanbul Programme of Action), the Almaty Programme of Action: Addressing the Needs of Landlocked Developing Countries within a New Global Framework for Transit Transport Cooperation for Landlocked and Transit Developing Countries, the political declaration on Africa's development needs, and the New Partnership for Africa's Development [**ADD: and Paris Principles and Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action**]. We also reaffirm our commitment to the Programme of Action of the ICPD, the Beijing Platform of Action, and the Outcome document of the September 2013 special event to follow up efforts made towards achieving the Millennium Development Goals.

We reaffirm that we continue to be guided by the purposes and principles of the Charter of the United Nations, with full respect for international law and its principles. We further reaffirm the importance of freedom, peace and security, respect for all human rights, including the right to development and the right to an adequate standard of living, including the right to food, the rule of law, good governance, gender equality, women's empowerment and the overall commitment to just and democratic societies for development. We reaffirm the importance of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, as well as other international instruments relating to human rights and international law. We recognize that people, of all ages and abilities, are at the centre of sustainable development and, in this regard, we strive for a world that is just, equitable and inclusive, and we commit to work together to promote sustained and inclusive economic growth, social development and environmental protection and thereby to benefit all.

We call for holistic and integrated approaches to sustainable development that will guide humanity to live in harmony with nature and lead to efforts to restore the health and integrity of the Earth's ecosystem. We acknowledge the natural and cultural diversity of the world, and recognize that all cultures and civilizations can contribute to sustainable development.

We affirm that there are different approaches, visions, models and tools available to each country, in accordance with its national circumstances and priorities, to achieve sustainable development in its three dimensions.

We recognize that each country faces specific challenges to achieve sustainable development, and we underscore the special challenges facing the most vulnerable countries and, in particular, African countries, least developed countries, landlocked developing countries and small island developing States, as well as the specific challenges facing the middle-income countries. Countries in situations of conflict also need special attention.

We reaffirm all the principles of the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development, including, inter alia, the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities, as set out in principle 7 thereof.

We reaffirm our commitment to strengthen international cooperation to address the persistent challenges related to sustainable development for all, in particular in developing countries. Sustainable development can only be achieved with a broad alliance of people, governments, civil society and the private sector, all working together [ADD: guided by accountability mechanisms] to secure the future we want for present and future generations.

We reaffirm that the means of implementation identified in Agenda 21, the Programme for the Further Implementation of Agenda 21, the Johannesburg Plan of Implementation, the Monterrey Consensus of the International Conference on Financing for Development and the Doha Declaration on Financing for Development are indispensable for achieving the full and effective translation of sustainable development commitments into tangible sustainable development outcomes. In this regard, we look forward to the report of the Intergovernmental Committee of Experts on Sustainable Development Financing and the substantive outcome of the third International Conference on Financing for Development in July 2015. We reiterate that each country has primary responsibility for its own economic and social development and that the role of national policies, domestic resources and development strategies cannot be overemphasized. We reaffirm that developing countries need additional resources for sustainable development. We recognize the need for significant mobilization of resources from a variety of sources and the effective use of financing, in order to promote sustainable development. We acknowledge that good governance and the rule of law at the national and international levels are essential for sustained, inclusive and equitable economic growth, sustainable development and the eradication of poverty and hunger.

We also acknowledge that the implementation of sustainable development goals will depend on the active engagement of all public and private stakeholders. A robust mechanism of implementation review [ADD: with well-integrated independent monitoring and oversight mechanisms] will be essential for the success of the SDGs. The High Level Political Forum is to play a key role in this regard.

Sustainable Development Goals are accompanied by targets and will be further elaborated through indicators focused on measurable outcomes. They are action oriented, global in nature and universally applicable to all countries, while taking into account different national realities, capacities and levels of development and respecting national policies and priorities. These goals constitute an integrated, indivisible set of global priorities for sustainable development. Targets are defined as global targets, with each government setting its own national targets guided by the global level of ambition but taking into account national circumstances. The goals and targets integrate economic, social and environmental aspects and recognize their interlinkages in achieving sustainable development in all its dimensions.

List of Proposed Sustainable Development Goals to be attained by 2030

[Alternative SDG 1: End poverty and reduce inequality in all its forms everywhere]

[Alternative SDG 2: End hunger, <u>achieve food sovereignty and improve</u> nutrition <u>for all</u>, and promote sustainable agriculture]

[Alternative SDG 3: Attain universal public health care and healthy lives for all]

[Alternative SDG 4: Provide <u>equitable and inclusive</u> quality <u>public</u> education and life-long learning opportunities for all]

5. Attain gender equality, empower women and girls everywhere

[Alternative SDG 6: Ensure the right to water, its availability and sustainable use and sanitation for all]

[Alternative SDG 7: Ensure access to affordable, sustainable and reliable modern energy for all]

- 8. Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all
- 9. Promote sustainable infrastructure and industrialization and foster innovation
- 10. Reduce inequality within and between countries
- 11. Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe and sustainable
- 12. Promote sustainable consumption and production patterns

[Alternative SDG 13: Tackle climate change, disaster risk reduction and its impacts]

- 14. Conserve and promote sustainable use of oceans, seas and marine resources
- 15. Protect and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, halt desertification, land degradation and biodiversity loss

[Alternative SDG 16: Achieve peaceful and inclusive societies, access to justice for all, <u>rule of law, re-</u><u>sponsive</u> and capable institutions]

17. Strengthen the means of implementation and the global partnership for sustainable development

PROPOSED GOAL 1 End poverty and reduce inequality in all its forms everywhere

<u>Comment</u>: Both inequality and climate change will worsen the harm that conflict and disasters are already inflicting on millions of people. We recommend inclusion of text addressing impact of disasters in the context of eliminating poverty.

1.1 by 2030, bring to zero the number of people living in extreme poverty, currently estimated at less than \$1.25 a day in low income countries

[Alternative 1.2: by 2030, reduce by at least half the proportion of people of all ages living below <u>x calorific</u> <u>intake</u>]

[Alternative 1.3: by 2030, implement <u>universal</u> appropriate social protection measures including floors, with a focus on coverage of the poor, <u>women, children and persons with disabilities</u> and people in vulnerable situations <u>leading to social participation</u>]

[Alternative 1.4: by 2030 secure equal access for all men and women, particularly those most in need, to basic services, the right to own land and property, productive resources and financial services, <u>with respect for human diversities</u>.]

[Alternative 1.5 / previous version 1.6: by 2030 strengthen early warning and disaster risk reduction systems and related capacities including effective rehabilitation, aiming to build resilience and protecting the poor and those in vulnerable situations from disasters, shocks, and climate-related extreme events and manmade disasters]

[New 1.6 / Previous 1.4: by 2030 achieve equal access to productive employment and decent work with living wages for all, including the poor, persons with disabilities, and other people in vulnerable situations as well as women, indigenous people and young people]

[New 1.7 / Previous target 'd': by 2030 reduce by x% deaths and economic losses related to disasters]

- 1.a. ensure significant mobilization of resources from a variety of sources to provide adequate and predictable means to implement programmes and policies to end poverty in all its dimensions
- 1.b Create sound policy frameworks, at national, regional and international levels, based on pro-poor development strategies to ensure accelerated investments in poverty eradication actions

PROPOSED GOAL 2 End hunger, <u>achieve food sovereignty and improve</u> nutrition for all, and promote sustainable agriculture

<u>Comment</u>: Keep the emphasis on small-farmers and resilience in the targets, do not weaken

[Alternative 2.1: by 2030 end hunger and ensure that all people have access to adequate, safe, affordable, <u>diverse</u> and nutritious food all year round]

[Alternative 2.2: by 2025 end all forms of malnutrition, with special attention to stunting by 40% and wasting to less than 5% in children under five years of age, and address the nutritional needs of pregnant and lactating women]

[Alternative 2.3: by 2030 substantially increase small-scale food producers' productivity and incomes, particularly of women, family farmers and pastoralists through secure access for all to productive resources and inputs, knowledge, financial services and markets, <u>agriculture and water commons</u>] [Alternative 2.4: by 2030 implement sustainable and resilient agricultural <u>and agro-ecological</u> practices including for adaptation to climate change, extreme weather, drought and disasters, and progressively enhance soil quality]

- 2.5 by 2020 maintain genetic diversity of seeds, cultivated plants, farmed and domesticated animals and their wild relatives, and ensure access to and fair and equitable sharing of benefits arising from the utilization of genetic resources and associated traditional knowledge as internationally agreed
- 2.a increase investment in rural infrastructure, agricultural research, technology development, and capable institutions, particularly in countries that are net food importers

[Alternative 2.b: phase out all forms of agricultural export <u>and other</u> subsidies <u>and all trade-distorting meas-</u> <u>ures that are harmful for small producers in developing countries</u>]

[Alternative 2.c: end extreme food price volatility including through improved functioning and regulation of food commodity markets, and improved market information, <u>and support public food stockholding in developing countries</u>]

<u>Comment</u>: Public food stockholding is essential for developing countries with a large poor and underfed population for ensuring access to food and guarding against global and domestic food price volatility which hurts both poor producers and consumers. With the recent National Food Security Act (NFSA) in India it is necessary to support public food stockholding with necessary subsidies on both consumption and production but the latter is now being challenged by WTO rules.

2.d create and diversify seed and plant banks, including with traditional varieties, at national, regional and international levels, to safeguard seed and genetic plant diversity

PROPOSED GOAL 3 Attain <u>universal public health care</u> healthy lives for all

<u>Comment</u>: Focus must be on universal and publicly (government) financed health care which is provided through well-funded public services that are free at the point of use and accessible to the most marginalised.

- 3.1 by 2030 reduce the global maternal mortality ratio to less than 70 per 100,000 live births
- 3.2 by 2030 end preventable newborn, infant and under-five deaths
- 3.3 by 2030 end the epidemics of HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria, and neglected tropical diseases
- 3.4 by 2030 reduce substantially morbidity and mortality from non-communicable diseases (NCDs) through prevention and treatment, promote mental health and wellbeing, and strengthen prevention and treatment of narcotic drug, alcohol, and substance abuse
- 3.5 by 2030 halve deaths from road traffic accidents

[Alternative 3.6: achieve universal health <u>care</u>, including financial risk protection, access to <u>universal</u> essential healthcare, and access to safe, effective and affordable essential medicines and vaccines for all]

<u>Comment</u>: We call for healthcare not health coverage as the latter is more about insurance and less about taxfinanced provisioning. Also, the term 'essential health care' is technically invalid. The term 'essential' limits the scope whereas 'universal healthcare' is about a set of minimum standards.

- 3.7 by 2030 substantially reduce the number of deaths and illnesses from air (indoor and outdoor), water and soil pollution
- 3.a strengthen implementation of the Framework Convention on Tobacco Control in all countries who have ratified the Convention and urge countries that have not ratified it to ratify and implement it

[Alternative 3.b: support <u>private sector led and developing country based research</u> and development of vaccines and medicines for the communicable diseases that primarily affect developing countries, provide access to affordable essential medicines, and support developing countries' use of TRIPS flexibilities

3.c increase substantially the recruitment, development and training and retention of the health workforce in developing countries, especially in LDCs

PROPOSED GOAL 4 Provide <u>equitable and inclusive</u> quality <u>public</u> education and life-long learning opportunities for all

<u>**Comment**</u>: The emphasis must be on 'public' as evidence from OECD countries shows that sustained public provisioning on education is critical for improved education outcomes.

[Alternative 4.1: by 2030 provide all children access to quality <u>education and</u> early childhood care and preprimary education]

[Alternative 4.2: by 2030, ensure all girls and boys complete free, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and effective learning outcomes]

[Alternative 4.3: by 2030 ensure equal access for all to <u>free</u> affordable quality tertiary education, including <u>vocational education and training and</u> university]

[Alternative 4.4: by 2030 ensure universal adult literacy and equitable access to life-long learning, provide employable skills especially to young women and men, and increase by at least x% adult literacy and basic numeracy]

[Alternative 4.5: by 2030, eliminate gender disparities and ensure equal access to all levels of education and vocational training <u>aligned with labour market needs</u> for people <u>from marginalized communities and</u> in vulnerable situations, including persons with disabilities]

[Alternative 4.6: by 2030 integrate into education programs knowledge and skills necessary for sustainable development, human rights, gender equality, promoting a culture of peace and non-violence and culture's contribution to sustainable development]

[Alternative 4.a: by 2030 <u>ensure that all learners are taught by qualified</u>, professionally-trained, motivated and well-supported teachers by increasing substantially the recruitment, development and training and retention of the education workforce, especially in LDCs, including through international cooperation for teacher training in developing countries]

[Alternative 4.b: by 2020 expand by x% globally the number of scholarships for students and government officials from developing countries in particular LDCs to enrol in higher education, including vocational training, programmes in developed countries and other developing countries with particular attention to marginalised groups]

[Alternative 4.c: by 2030 ensure safe, inclusive and effective learning environments for all and build and upgrade education facilities that are child and gender sensitive] [New 4.d: by 2030, all countries allocate at least 4-6% of their Gross Domestic Product (GDP) or at least 15-20% of their public expenditure to education, prioritizing groups most in need; and strengthen financial cooperation for education, prioritizing countries most in need]

PROPOSED GOAL 5 Attain gender equality, empower women and girls everywhere

<u>**Comment</u>**: While we welcome the re-insertion of timelines to the proposed targets, we are concerned with some of the changes made to Goal 5 in this version of the document. Two instances: a target on evaluating gender-responsiveness of policy commitments through gender responsive budgeting has been removed. Additionally, specific reference needs to be made to the most-marginalised among women, e.g. women and girls with disabilities.</u>

- 5.1 end all forms of discrimination against all women and girls
- 5.2 eliminate all forms of violence against all women and girls in public and private spaces and end their trafficking and sexual exploitation
- 5.3 eliminate all harmful practices, such as child, early and forced marriage and female genital mutilations
- 5.4 recognize and redistribute unpaid care and domestic work through shared responsibility within the family and the provision of appropriate public services
- 5.5 ensure full and effective participation and leadership of women at all levels of decision-making in the public and private sectors
- 5.6 ensure universal access to sexual and reproductive health and reproductive rights in accordance with the Programme of Action of the ICPD and the Beijing Platform for Action

[New 5.7 / previous 5.10: promote the availability of gender-disaggregated data to improve gender equality policies, including gender-responsive budgeting]

- 5.a ensure women's equal right to own and control assets and productive resources
- 5.b by 2030 achieve universal access to ICT for women and men to promote women's empowerment
- 5.c promote sound, enforceable and monitorable legislation and policies for the promotion of gender equality at all levels

PROPOSED GOAL 6 Ensure <u>the right to water, its</u> availability and sustainable use of water and sanitation for all

<u>Comment</u>: In its present version, the proposed targets are technology-focused and not referencing the role of the community adequately. Further, there is a need to foreground the goal more in line with 'sustainable and climate resilient' water resources management.

- 6.1 by 2030, achieve universal access to safe and affordable drinking water for all
- 6.2 by 2030, achieve adequate sanitation and hygiene for all, paying special attention to the needs of women and girls
- 6.3 by 2030, improve water quality by reducing pollution, eliminating dumping of chemicals and hazardous materials, doubling wastewater treatment and increasing recycling and reuse by x% globally
- 6.4 by 2030, improve water-use efficiency by x% across all sectors and bring freshwater withdrawals in line with sustainable supply

- 6.5 by 2030 implement integrated <u>sustainable and climate-resilient</u> water resources management at all levels, and through trans-boundary cooperation as appropriate
- 6.6 by 2030 decrease by x% mortality and y% losses caused by water-related disasters
- 6.a by 2030, expand international cooperation and support in <u>people-centric</u>, <u>appropriate and sustainable</u> water and sanitation related <u>knowledge</u>, <u>exchange and sharing</u>, <u>approaches</u>, <u>processes and</u> technologies including water harvesting, <u>for artificial recharge</u>, <u>sustainable low-cost</u> desalination technologies and wastewater treatment, recycling and reuse

PROPOSED GOAL 7 Ensure <u>access to affordable</u>, sustainable <u>and reliable modern</u> energy for all

<u>**Comment:**</u> While we welcome the target on phasing out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies in a way that is sensitive to the poorest, mere doubling the renewable energy share in global energy mix might not suffice as the share of modern renewable energy sources (excluding traditional biomass) is less than 10% ¹². A more scientific assessment on the share in the global energy mix is needed before firming this goal.

[Alternative 7.1: by 2030 ensure universal access to affordable, sustainable and reliable energy services <u>and</u> <u>diversify sources of energy with focus on non-electrical forms of energy</u>]

[Suggest revision of 7.2 based on more scientific assessment of recommended modern renewable energy to total global energy mix]

- 7.3 double the global rate of improvement in energy efficiency by 2030
- 7.4 by 2030 phase out fossil fuel production and consumption subsidies that encourage wasteful use, while ensuring secure affordable energy for the poor

[New 7.5: by 2020 reduce wasteful energy use in developed countries by x%]

7.a enhance international cooperation to facilitate access to clean energy technologies, including advanced and cleaner fossil fuel technologies, and promote public and private investment in energy infrastructure and clean energy technologies

[Alternative 7.b / previous 7.6: by 2030 expand and upgrade as appropriate infrastructure and technology for transmission and distribution of modern, renewable and sustainable energy services for all, including with a view to doubling primary energy supply per capita for LDCs]

PROPOSED GOAL 8 Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all

[Alternative 8.1 / previous 8.9: increase the share of high productivity sectors and activities in the economy, and strengthen productive capacities through technological upgrading, greater value addition and product diversification, with a particular focus on LDCs]

[Alternative 8.2: sustain income growth of the bottom 40% of the income distribution of each country of at least y (greater than x)% to reduce income inequalities by 2030]

¹² http://www.google.co.in/imgres?imgurl=http%3A%2F%2Fempiregreen.org%2Fwp-content%2Fuploads%2F2013%2F 08%2Frenewables_2013_fig1.png&imgrefurl=http%3A%2F%2Fempiregreen.org%2Frenewables-2013%2F&h=325&w= 640&tbnid=guq3sSzRBNwcVM%3A&zoom=1&docid=qyTw9CQDOIhEiM&ei=qNDAU-ntEo-7uATOyYKYAQ&tbm=isch&v ed=0CCAQMygAMAA&iact=rc&uact=3&dur=2654&page=1&start=0&ndsp=14; http://www.un.org/esa/sustdev/sdissues/ energy/op/beijing_re_egm/beijing_re_report.pdf

[Alternative 8.3 / previous 8.10: promote greater resource efficiency of economic activities, including through sustainable supply chains, according to national circumstances and capacities]

- 8.4 by 2030 achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all women and men, including for young people and persons with disabilities, and equal pay for work of equal value
- 8.5 take immediate and effective measures to secure the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour, and by 2020 end child labour in all its forms
- 8.6 protect the rights and ensure safe and secure working environments of all workers, including migrant workers and those in precarious employment in accordance with ILO norms and standards

[New 8.7 / previous 8.6: by 2030 create an enabling environment for sustainable and accountable business with strong national economic institutions and policies that support decent work practices]

[New 8.8 / previous 8.14: promote formalization of informal sector activities and employment]

8.a improve Aid for Trade support for developing countries, notably through the Enhanced Integrated Framework for LDCs

[New 8.b / previous 8.16: explore the possibility of a broader system of capital accounting looking beyond GDP and incorporating social, human and environmental capital]

PROPOSED GOAL 9 Promote sustainable infrastructure and industrialization and foster innovation

<u>**Comment:**</u> We welcome most of the new proposed targets as these significantly attend to the specific developing countries' perspective and requirements.

- 9.1 support the development of quality, reliable, safe, sustainable and resilient infrastructure for energy, water, waste management, transport, ports and ICT, with a focus on affordable access for all
- 9.2 improve regional and trans-border infrastructure to promote regional connectivity and integration and to facilitate trade
- 9.3 create decent industrial jobs and significantly raise industry's share of employment and GDP in line with national circumstances, including doubling manufacturing's share in LDCs by 2030
- 9.4 ensure that small-scale industrial and other enterprises, particularly in LDCs, have affordable access to credit and are integrated into national, regional and global value chains and markets
- 9.5 by 2030 upgrade infrastructure and retrofit industries to make them sustainable, with greater adoption of clean technologies and environmentally sound industrial processes, with developed countries taking the lead and all countries taking action in accordance with their respective capabilities
- 9.a facilitate sustainable infrastructure development, with emphasis on enhanced financial and technical support to LDCs
- 9.b ensure a conducive policy environment at all levels for industrial development, promoting entrepreneurship and innovation, with special attention to national circumstances in developing countries
- 9.c enhance R&D activities and upgrade technological capabilities including access to environmentally sound technologies in all countries

PROPOSED GOAL 10 Reduce inequality within and between countries

10.1 through 2030 sustain income growth of the bottom 40% of the population at a rate higher than the national average

[Alternative 10.2 / previous 10.3: by 2030 reduce economic, social, and environmental inequalities of opportunity and outcome among social groups through reducing wealth inequality between richest 10% and poorest 40%]

[Proposed 10.2.1: Reduce income inequality so that the post-tax income of the top 10% to be no more than the post-transfer income of the bottom 40%]

- 10.2 reduce inequalities of opportunity and outcome, including through eliminating discriminatory laws, policies and practices and promoting appropriate legislation, policies and actions in this regard
- 10.3 progressively adopt policies especially fiscal policies to promote greater equality
- 10.4 improve regulation and monitoring of global financial markets and institutions and strengthen implementation of such regulations
- 10.5 facilitate orderly, safe, and responsible migration and mobility of people, including through implementation of planned and managed migration policies
- 10.6 by 2030, ensure equitable representation and voice of developing countries in decision making in global institutions of governance and development
- 10.a respect the principle of special and differential treatment for least developed countries in relevant international agreements including the WTO
- 10.b direct ODA and encourage financial flows, including foreign direct investment, to states where the need is greatest, in particular LDCs, African countries, SIDS, and LLDCs
- 10.c by 2030, reduce to less than 5% the transaction costs of migrant remittances

[New 10.d / previous 10.7: by 2030 ensure the availability of high-quality, timely and disaggregated data to ensure monitoring of progress for marginalized groups and people in vulnerable situations]

PROPOSED GOAL 11 Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe and sustainable

[Alternative 11.1 / previous 11.1: by 2030, ensure universal access to adequate and affordable housing and basic services for all, eliminate informal housing conditions everywhere as also a measure to build resilience of communities to natural disasters]

- 11.2 by 2030, provide access to safe, affordable, accessible and sustainable transport for all, and expand public transport
- 11.3 enhance capacities for integrated and sustainable human settlement planning and management for all, and reduce urban sprawl
- 11.4 by 2030 halve the number of deaths and decrease by 50% economic losses relative to GDP caused by natural disasters
- 11.5 by 2030, ensure universal access to safe, inclusive and accessible public spaces, particularly for women and children and people with disabilities

- 11.a integrate economic and social links between urban, peri-urban and rural areas into national and regional development planning
- 11.b by 2020, increase by x% the number of cities and human settlements adopting and implementing integrated policies and plans towards inclusion, resilience, mitigation and adaptation to climate change and natural disasters
- 11.c support least developed countries, including through financial and technical assistance, for sustainable buildings utilizing local content and materials

PROPOSED GOAL 12 Promote sustainable consumption and production patterns

<u>Comment</u>: The focus of sustainable consumption and production seems to lie mainly in the domain of developing countries and countries in transition. However much more thought needs to go into **downsizing consumption patterns in developed countries** for them to be sustainable (particularly in relation to lifestyle concerns). We need to arrive at a middle path of defining 'well being' that all human beings can and should have access to and hence the need to work towards development of indicators which define 'conspicuous consumption'.

[Alternative 12.1: by 2030, <u>full implementation</u> into national strategies and plans, as envisioned in the 10-Year Framework of Programmes (10YFP) on sustainable consumption and production <u>patterns with developing</u> <u>countries leading the process</u>]

- 12.2 by 2030 reduce by half global food waste and production and post-harvest food losses and those along food supply chains
- 12.3 promote the sound management of chemicals and hazardous wastes in accordance with agreed international frameworks and by 2030 significantly reduce their release to air, water and soil
- 12.4 by 2030, substantially reduce all waste generation through prevention, reduction, recycling and reuse
- 12.5 increase the share of private sector actors incorporating sustainable development principles in their business practices, and by 2030 increase substantially the number of companies, especially large companies, that report on corporate social and environmental responsibility, including through integrated reporting
- 12.6 by 2030 substantially increase the share of public procurement that is sustainable
- 12.a promote the transfer and dissemination to developing countries of environmentally sound technologies that improve energy and resource efficiency
- 12.b assist developing countries to strengthen their scientific and technological capacities to move towards more sustainable patterns of consumption and production

[Alternative 12.c: by 2030 <u>foster North-North cooperation to promote</u> sustainable lifestyles <u>in developed</u> <u>countries</u>]

12.d by 2030 develop and implement planning and monitoring tools for sustainable tourism which creates jobs, promotes local culture and products, and safeguards the world's cultural and natural heritage

[New 12.e: Ensure finance and technological support to small producers (SMEs) especially in developing countries for meeting sustainability standards in public procurement]

<u>**Comment:**</u> With higher standard setting for public procurement, small producers especially in developing countries will be cut out from sizeable local market shares of about 12-20% in developing countries. Only large com-

panies in developed countries will be able to access these markets. Many developing countries including India use public procurement market to give preference to SMEs and disadvantaged groups.

[New 12.f: <u>Strengthen North-North scientific and technological cooperation and best practices to promote</u> <u>SCP in developed countries</u>]

PROPOSED GOAL 13 Tackle climate change, '<u>disaster risk reduction</u>' and its impacts¹³

<u>**Comment</u>**: We are concerned with the watered-down language to the modified text. A critical concern lies with attributing **country responsibility** for emission reductions which has always been a bone of contention between countries. Unless there is a convergence in this regard, the problem of unsustainable CO2 emissions will continue. Additionally, concrete measurable indicators such as holding temperature rise by 1.5°C are necessary.</u>

13.1 strengthen resilience and adaptive capacity to climate induced hazards and natural disasters in all countries

[Alternative 13.2: integrate climate change adaptation and <u>disaster risk reduction</u>, and mitigation into national strategies and plans]

[Alternative 13.3: improve education, <u>vulnerability assessments of hazard prone regions</u>, awareness raising and human and institutional capacity on climate change mitigation, impact reduction, and early warning]

[New 13.4 / previous 13.1: by 20xx hold the increase in global average temperature below an x degree C rise in accordance with international agreements with efforts to progressively reduce it to 1.5 degrees C]

13. a ensure the fulfilment of the commitment undertaken by developed country Parties to a goal of mobilizing jointly USD100 billion annually by 2020 from all sources to address the needs of developing countries in the context of meaningful mitigation actions and transparency on implementation

[New 13.b: provide enhanced financial support to LDCs at x%, including through Green Climate Fund and LDCs Fund (as from 12.4 of G77 and China Common Position Paper on Means of Implementation for SDGs¹⁴)]

[New 13.c: scale up support for developing countries in particular LDCs, LLDCs, SIDS by investments in safe and clean renewable energy and infrastructure (12.5 of G77 and China Paper)]

[New 13.d: remove by 2020, barriers that developing countries face or may face, in obtaining access to clean energy technology (12.9 of G77 and China Paper)]

PROPOSED GOAL 14 Conserve and promote sustainable use oceans, seas and marine resources

- 14.1 by 2030, prevent and control, and reduce by x% globally, marine pollution of all kinds, particularly from land-based activities
- 14.2 by 2020, sustainably manage, restore and protect marine ecosystems from destruction, including by strengthening their resilience, and address ocean acidification and its impacts
- 14.3 by 2020, effectively regulate <u>commercial and industrial</u> harvesting, end overfishing, illegal, unreported and unregulated (IUU) fishing and destructive fishing practices, to restore by 2030 fish stocks at least to levels that can produce maximum sustainable yield

¹³ The targets under a Climate Change goal may be part of and complementary to possible targets to be agreed within the framework of the UNFCCC negotiations.

¹⁴ http://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/4209G77%20common%20position%20MOI.pdf

- 14.4 By 2020, conserve at least 10% of coastal and marine areas, including through establishing effectively managed marine protected areas and other effective area-based conservation measures, consistent with international law and based on best available scientific information
- 14.5 by 2020, eliminate fisheries subsidies which contribute to overcapacity and overfishing, and refrain from introducing new such subsidies, taking into account the importance of this sector to developing countries, notably least developed countries and SIDS
- 14.a increase scientific knowledge, and transfer of marine technology, and develop research infrastructure and capacities to enhance the contribution of marine biodiversity to the development of developing countries, in particular SIDS and LDCs
- 14.b by 2030 increase the economic benefits to SIDS and LDCs from the sustainable use of marine resources, including through sustainable management of fisheries, aquaculture, tourism and provide equitable access of small-scale artisanal fishers to marine resources and markets
- 14.c enforce international law on territorial waters to stop illegal fishing and exploitation of marine resources in territorial waters, particularly of developing countries

[New 14.d / previous 14.9: by 2020, eliminate subsidies which contribute to overcapacity and over-fishing, and refrain from introducing new such subsidies, taking into account the need of developing countries, no-tably least developed countries and SIDS]

[New 14.e / previous 14.11: <u>implement integrated and participatory coastal management to increase resil-</u> ience of coastal ecosystems and coastal communities]

PROPOSED GOAL 15 Protect and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, halt desertification, land degradation and biodiversity loss

15.1 by 2020 ensure conservation and sustainable use of ecosystems, in particular wetlands, mountains and drylands, in line with international agreements

[Alternative 15.2: by 2030, ensure the implementation of sustainable management of all types of forests, halt deforestation, <u>check rainforest loss due to growth in agro-fuels</u>, and increase reforestation by x% globally]

- 15.2 by 2030, achieve a land degradation neutral world, and restore degraded land including land affected by desertification and drought
- 15.3 by 2020 take urgent and significant action to halt the loss of biodiversity, and protect and prevent the extinction of known threatened species
- 15.4 by 2030, end poaching and trafficking of protected species of flora and fauna, and end demand and supply of illegal wildlife products
- 15.5 by 2020 introduce measures to prevent the introduction and significantly reduce the impact of invasive alien species on land and water ecosystems

[New 15.7: phase out use of chemicals in agriculture, industry, and settlements, that lead to irreversible ecological degradation and the poisoning of wildlife]

15.a by 2020, mobilize and significantly increase from all sources financial resources to implement the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011-2020

- 15.b mobilize significantly resources from all sources and at all levels to finance sustainable forest management, and provide adequate incentives to developing countries to advance sustainable forest management, including for conservation and reforestation
- 15.c enhance support to developing countries efforts to combat poaching and illegal trafficking of endangered species, including by increasing the capacity of local communities to pursue sustainable livelihood opportunities

[New 15.d / previous 15.11: integrate disaster risk reduction, natural resources and biodiversity values into national and local planning, development processes, and accounts]

PROPOSED GOAL 16 Achieve peaceful and inclusive societies, access to justice for all, <u>rule of law, responsive</u> and capable institutions

<u>Comment</u>: While welcoming the centrality to access to justice, we would urge changing 'effective' to '**responsive**' as efficiency function only addresses the question of whether the institutions function at all / properly and do not reflect on whether the institutions are framed in a rights-perspective and promote social justice for all. Also critical is the extent of accountability mechanisms inbuilt in these institutions to ensure greater monitoring, which then make the systems more responsive.

Number of targets under proposed SDG 16 is down from 17 to 8 in the latest OWG Document. While we recognise that this is in keeping with the overall trimming down of the document and reflected across all other proposed SDGs, the proposal by many member states as well as non-state actors to break down proposed goal 16 into two – one of peaceful societies and access to justice and the other on capable institutions has not been accommodated. Hence, several critical proposals get diluted or completely left out in this trimming down exercise. Given that this goal would define how transformative and ambitious the new development agenda can be, we strongly recommend that the focus be more on ensuring all proposals are included rather than maintaining uniformity in terms of number of targets across all goals.

The latest version of SDG 16 has dropped all reference of illicit trade in arms and reference to internally displaced persons. The goal also has significantly diluted reference to addressing corruption by clubbing it with illicit financial flows, which is in itself a serious concern. Access to information although retained in the new draft does not include critical aspects of data related to public finance, transactions between state and private sector especially related to extractives sector - a key determinant of violence and conflict in most developing countries. We welcome the language of 16.4 that is considerably strengthened over the previous draft. We also welcome the progressive language in 16.8 and more specifically 16.8.b that is an addition over the previous versions as it reflects on participation of developing countries' role in international decision making.

[Alternative 16.1: by 2030 reduce levels of violence <u>especially sexual violence against women and children</u> and <u>socially-excluded groups, by x%</u> and halve related death rates everywhere]

[Alternative 16.2: by 2030 end abuse, exploitation, and violence against children everywhere]

[Alternative 16.3: by 2030 reduce illicit financial flows by x% globally, increase stolen asset recovery and return by y% globally, fight all forms of organized crime, and reduce corruption and bribery in all its forms by x% and at all levels and ensure accountability and transparency in institutional mechanisms, systems and processes]

16.4 by 2030 increase inclusive, participatory and representative decision-making at all levels and ensure prior informed consent of indigenous and local communities in decision-making and natural resources management, and promote the use of their traditional knowledge and culture [Alternative 16.5 / FA 19, Rule of Law (b): by 2030 provide equal access to independent and responsive justice systems including related to property and tenure rights, employment, business, taxation, trade and finance for all]

[Alternative 16.6 / FA 19, Rule of Law (c): by 2020 provide public services for all, including legal identity]

[Alternative 16.7: promote free and easy access to information, freedom of expression, association and peace-ful protest]

16.8 broaden and strengthen the participation of developing countries in international economic and financial decision making and norm setting

[New 16.9 / earlier 16.9: by 20xx recognise the number of internally displaced persons and refugees and minorities, including linguistic, ethnic, religious and sexual, in all countries as citizens with equal rights¹⁵]

[New 16.10: ensure by 20xx, increased openness of state-business transactions to public scrutiny, including in the extractive resource sector]

[Alternative 16.a: develop effective, accountable and transparent public institutions at all levels (including Public Private Partnership initiatives) [MOVE FOLLOWING TEXT TO SEPARATE TARGET: including security and police forces]

[Alternative 16.b: <u>by 2030</u> strengthen national institutions and international cooperation to combat <u>trans-</u> national crimes, <u>eliminate and recover x%</u> illicit <u>financial</u> flows, <u>money laundering, tax evasion, transfer</u> <u>mispricing by y%</u>, and <u>combat</u> organized crime]

[New 16.c / previous 16.10: by 20xx enhance the capacity, professionalism and accountability of the security forces, police and judiciary by acknowledging role of vulnerability in building a 'just' and peaceful society]

PROPOSED GOAL 17 Strengthen the means of implementation and the global partnership for sustainable development ¹⁶

TRADE

[Alternative 17.1: promote a universal, [DELETE <u>rules-based</u>, <u>open</u>] non-discriminatory and equitable multilateral trading system <u>through fair</u>, <u>equitable and development friendly rules and protection of national</u> <u>policy space in bilateral</u>, <u>plurilateral trade and investment agreements</u>]

<u>Comment</u>: With the proliferation of bilateral and plurilateral trade and investment agreements which are more challenging and threatening for development, it seems myopic to limit proposals only to the multilateral frameworks, the latter nonetheless being our preferred option.

- 17.2 improve market access for exports of developing countries, in particular Least Developed Countries, African countries, LLDCs and SIDS with a view to significantly increasing their share in global exports, including doubling the LDC share by 2020
- 17.3 realize timely implementation of duty-free, quota-free market access on a lasting basis for all least developed countries consistent with WTO decisions and the Istanbul Programme of Action

¹⁵ http://www.wadanatodo.net/documents/outputs/mdgs/6%20Peace.pdf

¹⁶ To be aligned with the outcomes of the report of the Intergovernmental Committee of Experts on Sustainable Development Financing and the third International Conference on Financing for Development in July 2015.

FINANCE

<u>Comment</u>: We propose strengthening language and focussing more on domestic tax systems, tackling tax evasion and avoidance, and specific reference to the \$100bn climate finance target, and support for a Financial Transaction Tax.

[Alternative 17.4: developed countries implement fully ODA commitments to provide 0.7% of GNI in ODA to developing countries, with the objective of increasing this to 1.0% by 2030, of which 0.15-0.20% to least-developed countries [DELETE: on an agreed timeline] by 2020]

[Alternative 17.5: strengthen domestic resource mobilization, including through international support to improve domestic capacity for tax collection, <u>tax evasion and avoidance</u>, <u>revenue transparency and accountabil-</u> <u>ity of foreign corporations in developing countries</u> and mobilize additional international financial resources from multiple sources <u>such as Financial Transactions Tax</u>]

[Alternative 17.6: assist developing countries in attaining long term debt sustainability, <u>through debt relief</u>, <u>debt financing and debt restructuring</u>]

[New target under Finance: <u>ensure effective regulation and supervision of international financial markets and</u> institutions, including controls over international capital flows to ensure the efficiency and stability of such flows]

<u>Comment</u>: This has been left out completely either from goal specific or stand alone MOI. This needs to be included either here or under the Inequality MOI where it was included in previous draft but is stands deleted now.

TECHNOLOGY

17.7 promote North-South, South-South and triangular regional and international collaboration on and access to science, technology and innovation, and enhance knowledge sharing, including through a possible UN global technology facilitation mechanism

[Alternative 17.8: promote transfer and dissemination of clean and environmentally sound, <u>socially-relevant</u> and economically beneficial, technologies, <u>including removal of IPR barriers</u>, to developing countries, and encourage the full use of TRIPS flexibilities]

17.9 fully operationalize the Technology Bank and STI (Science, Technology and Innovation) Capacity Building Mechanism for LDCs by 2017

CAPACITY BUILDING

[Alternative 17.10: develop and implement effective and targeted capacity building programmes in <u>and led</u> <u>by</u> developing countries in support of national plans for implementing all sustainable development goals]

POLICY AND INSTITUTIONAL COHERENCE

[Alternative 17.11: enhance global macroeconomic policy, trade and finance coordination and policy coherence in support of sustainable development]

[Alternative 17.12: respect each country's policy space <u>including in their commitments in international</u> <u>agreements</u> with respect to establishing and implementing policies for poverty eradication and sustainable development]

[New target under Policy and institutional coherence: <u>ensure a legally binding multilateral code of conduct</u> for TNCs to secure social responsibility and accountability and prevent restrictive business practices]

MULTI-STAKEHOLDER PARTNERSHIPS

[Alternative 17.13: support current broad-based multi-stakeholder partnerships <u>with in-built oversight</u> <u>mechanisms</u> and encourage new ones <u>that are transparent</u>, <u>accountable</u>, <u>monitorable</u> that mobilize knowledge, expertise, technologies and financial resources to support the achievement of sustainable development goals in all countries, particularly developing countries]

[Alternative 17.14: encourage and promote public, public-private, and private special funds and foundations, building on the experience and resourcing strategies of partnerships [DELETE: such as GFATM, GEF, GAVI, BMGF, SE4All, EWEC]

<u>Comment</u>: Many of the examples cited are damaging for developing countries such as GAVI, SEA4ALL.

DATA, MONITORING AND ACCOUNTABILITY

- 17.15 by 2020, increase significantly the availability of high-quality and timely data disaggregated by income, gender, age, race, ethnicity, disability, geographic location and other characteristics relevant in national contexts, with capacity building support to developing countries, especially LDCs
- 17.16 undertake regular voluntary monitoring and reporting of progress on SDGs, led by governments, within a shared accountability framework, including means of implementation, the global partnership among Member States and multi-stakeholder initiatives and partnerships
- 17.17 by 2030 develop and progressively introduce a broader system of national accounting including natural, social and human capital and measures of progress beyond GDP, with supportive statistical capacity building in developing countries

This is a working document

Drafted and compiled by Pooja Parvati, *Wada Na Todo Abhiyan* with input from the following organizations / networks (in alphabetical order):

All India Women's Conference, INDIA (Kalyani Raj) Centre for Democracy and Social Action, NEW DELHI (Richa Singh) Centre for Social Justice, GUJARAT (Nupur Sinha) Confederation of Voluntary Associations, ANDHRA PRADESH (Mazher Hussain) Equals - Centre for Promotion of Social Justice, TAMIL NADU (Meenakshi Balasubramaniam) Nine is Mine Campaign, INDIA (Br Steve) National Campaign on Dalit Human Rights, NEW DELHI (Lee Macqueen Paul, Paul Divakar) Global Campaign for Education, NEW DELHI (Anjela Taneja) International Planned Parenthood Association, NEW DELHI (Susmitra Chaudhury) Jagori, NEW DELHI (Suneeta Dhar) Jan Swasthya Abhiyan, INDIA (N B Sarojini) Janvikas, GUJARAT (Gagan Sethi) Landesa NEW DELHI (Anisa Draboo) Laya Resource Centre, ANDHRA PRADESH (Nafisa D'Souza) National Disability Network, INDIA (Dorodi Sharma, Javed Abidi) **Oxfam INDIA** (Avinash Kumar, Deepak Xavier, Vanita Suneja) PRAXIS - Institute for Participatory Practices, NEW DELHI (Sowmya Bharadwaj) Public Advocacy Initiatives for Rights and Values in India, NEW DELHI (Ajay Jha) Save the Children NEW DELHI (Shireen Vakil Miller) Third World Network, NEW DELHI (K M Gopakumar, Ranja Sengupta) Wada Na Todo Abhiyan, INDIA (Amitabh Behar, Pooja Parvati, Saswati Swetlena) **VSO India** (Praveen Kumar)

About Wada Na Todo Abhiyan (WNTA)

Wada Na Todo Abhiyan (Hindi for 'Don't Break Your Promise Campaign') is a national campaign launched in 2004 as an outcome of World Social Forum in Mumbai. It is a coalition of over 4000 civil society organisations and networks in the country with the aim to hold the government accountable to its promise to end poverty and social exclusion. WNTA is also affiliated to the Global Call to Action against Poverty (GCAP).

For comments and questions, please write to <u>pooja.parvati@gmail.com</u> For further information, please visit our website <u>www.wadanatodo.net</u>



WADA NA TODO ABHIYAN National Secretariat C 1/ E, Second Floor, Green Park Extension, New Delhi – 110016 INDIA

www.wadanatodo.net

Design and Print: Aspire Design

